

Carroll County Board of Canvassers
300 S Center Street, Rm 212
Westminster, MD 21157

Friday, November 15, 2024 - Mail-In Ballot 2 Canvass

ATTENDEES

Board of Canvassers:

Name	Position	Party
Carol Coley	Member	Democratic
Karen Donaldson	Member	Republican
Mitch Edelman	Member	Democratic
Samuel Foster	Chairman	Democratic
Benjamin Watson	Secretary	Republican
Jack "Jay" Gullo	Board Counsel	

LBE Staff:

Name	Position
Jennifer Bartholow	Deputy Director
Eduardo DeLima	Election IT Specialist III
Lukas Faber	County Technician
Kimberly Bullock-Jones	Election Program Supervisor II
Isaac Nogueron	Election Program Specialist II
Erin Perrone	Election Director
Olivia Smith	Election Program Specialist I
John Michael Gudger	Election Program Specialist II
Mark Shaughney	Election Program Specialist II

Members of the Public:

There were no members of the public present.

All canvassing teams, duplicating team members, ballot scanner operating team members, envelope openers, and runners in attendance are listed under the Canvass Participants section below.

DECLARATION OF QUORUM PRESENT

The meeting of the Board of Canvassers began at 10 am on Friday, November 15, 2024, at the gymnasium of the Robert Moton Building, 300 S Center Street, Westminster. There was a quorum of the Board of Canvassers, and at least one member of the Board of Canvassers who is a registered voter of the principal minority party was present.

CONFIRMATION OF OATH

Heather DeWees, the Clerk of the Court for Carroll County, administered and recorded the oath of each member of the Board of Canvassers on Wednesday, September 18, 2024. Ms. DeWees administered and recorded the oath of board counsel on Wednesday, October 16, 2024.

Carroll County Board of Canvassers
300 S Center Street, Rm 212
Westminster, MD 21157

Friday, November 15, 2024 - Mail-In Ballot 2 Canvass

ANNOUNCEMENT OF OFFICERS

At a meeting on Wednesday, September 18, 2024, the Board of Canvassers elected Samuel Foster as Chairman of the Board of Canvassers and Benjamin Watson as Secretary.

PUBLIC NOTICE OF CANVASS

Mr. Foster noted that public notice of the mail-in ballot canvass was provided and that the notice was provided via the website, social media, and an email to various parties including candidates, central committees, and elected officials.

VERIFICATION OF THE SCANNING UNITS

Ms. Perrone stated that the ballot scanners being used in the canvass successfully passed Logic and Accuracy Testing on Friday, September 13, 2024. Ms. Perrone reported that the memory sticks created for this canvass were placed in the ballot scanners and sealed. Ms. Perrone noted the Ballot Scanner Serial Numbers and Seal Numbers from the Logic and Accuracy Testing documentation for each ballot scanner being used in the canvass.

Ms. Jones and Mr. DeLima verified that the seals on the ballot scanners were intact and recorded the scanner's serial number and seal number on the *DS200 Integrity Report – Pre-MIB1 Canvass*. Ms. Jones and Mr. DeLima noted that the ballot scanners' serial numbers and seal numbers from Logic and Accuracy Testing matched the ballot scanners' serial numbers and seal numbers before the canvass began.

The Board of Canvassers confirmed that the counts on the ballot scanners were zero. At the direction of Ms. Jones and Mr. DeLima, the Board of Canvassers signed the zero reports that were posted inside the front doors to the Robert Moton Building. After the Board of Canvassers signed the zero reports from each scanner, Ms. Bullock and Mr. Watson posted one copy of the Zero Report from the ballot scanners on the inside of the front doors to the Robert Moton Building. Ms. Jones and Mr. DeLima printed a second copy of the Zero Report, which were detached from the ballot scanners and attached to the *DS200 Integrity Report – MIB2 Canvass*.

A copy of the *DS200 Integrity Report – MIB2 Canvass* is attached to the minutes.

CANVASSING OF BALLOTS

Overview of Canvass Process

Ms. Perrone explained the rules concerning public observation of the canvass. Ms. Perrone provided an overview of the canvassing process and noted that the rules were posted in the canvass room. Ballots were distributed to the bipartisan team of election judges operating the envelope openers.

Each canvassing team determined whether the voter signed the oath. After verifying that the oath is signed and with the envelope face down, each canvassing team removed the ballot,

Carroll County Board of Canvassers
 300 S Center Street, Rm 212
 Westminster, MD 21157

Friday, November 15, 2024 - Mail-In Ballot 2 Canvass

taking care that the envelope stays face down. After removing all the ballots in the batch, the ballot envelopes were set aside. Each canvassing team reviewed the ballots for compliance and tabulating acceptability.

Web delivered ballots were duplicated by a bipartisan ballot duplication teams and verified for accuracy.

Ballots that were not in compliance were placed in a folder, with the canvassing team's number, or other information identifying the canvassing team to which the ballot belonged, and the reason for the referral written on the header sheet. The folder with the ballot inside was referred to the Board of Canvassers for later review.

Those ballots that were in compliance and could be read by the ballot scanner were referred to the Board of Canvassers for acceptance.

The Board of Canvassers convened at 11:00 a.m. to review referred ballots. The Board of Canvassers ruled on whether to accept or unanimously reject the referred mail-in ballots. See the tables below showing the ballots Ms. Perrone presented to the Board of Canvassers.

Batch Number	Referral Reason	Contest	Board Action	Vote
28 MIB held-back ballots	Voter intent	State Question 1	Duplicate the entire ballot with an Against vote for State Question 1	Unanimous Consent
Prov 69	Voter Intent	President	Overvote in President	Unanimous Consent
103 MIB	Voter Intent	President	Overvote in President	Unanimous Consent
1010	2 Ballots in Envelope	ALL	Reject Ballots	Unanimous Consent
1034 MIB2	Voter intent	State Question 1	Duplicate the entire ballot with a For vote for State Question 1	Unanimous Consent
FWAB	Voter Intent	Senate Rep.	Vote for Republic Candidate	Unanimous Consent

Referral Reason	Quantity	Board Action	Vote
Untimely Received	26	Reject all 26 ballots	Unanimous
No Oath Signature	11	Reject all 11 ballots	Unanimous

Updated: 12/18/2024

Carroll County Board of Canvassers
300 S Center Street, Rm 212
Westminster, MD 21157

Friday, November 15, 2024 - Mail-In Ballot 2 Canvass

In addition, the Board of Canvassers ruled on whether to accept or unanimously reject the referred provisional ballots from the provisional canvass held on Wednesday, November 13, 2024.

On Wednesday, November 13, 2024, Ms. Perrone presented 6 provisional ballots because the application is not eligible to receive a provisional ballot. At this canvass, there is now a total of 8 provisional ballots that should be rejected because of this reason. Mr. Watson made the motion to reject these provisional ballots. The motion was seconded by Ms. Donaldson, and the motion passed unanimously.

On Wednesday, November 13, 2024, Ms. Perrone presented 9 provisional ballots because the identification or DL# or ss3 was not timely received. At this canvass, there is now a total of 2 provisional ballots that should be rejected because of this reason.

On Wednesday, November 13, 2024, Ms. Perrone held back all the rejected provisional ballots because the DL# or SS# was received but not verified. Following the guidance from the State Board of Elections, a portion of those rejected provisional ballots are to be counted because the voter provided proof of residency. At this canvass, Ms. Perrone presented 4 provisional ballots for rejection because the DL# or SS# was received but not verified.

Let the record show that the Board unanimously rejected all the ballots presented at this canvass.

Canvass Participants

Canvasser	Names of Bi-Partisan Ballot Processing & Duplicating Canvassing Team Members
Team #1	Susan E. Whitcomb & Norma Bair
Team #2	Kristen McMasters & Paula Stonesifer
Team #3	E Beth Bowman & Richard Wills
Team #4	Josephine Billings & Delores Blubaugh
Team #5	Michelle Moreau & Estelle Frederick
Team #6	Cheryl Steinbacher & Kelly Devilbiss
Team #7	Wendy Raith & Judy Cook
Team #8	John Michael Gudger & Olivia Smith

Team	Names of Floor Runners
Runner #1	Robert Boblitz
Runner #2	Jeff Morse
Runner #3	Rodney Morris
Runner #4	Taylor Button

Carroll County Board of Canvassers
300 S Center Street, Rm 212
Westminster, MD 21157

Friday, November 15, 2024 - Mail-In Ballot 2 Canvass

Team	Names of Bi-Partisan Ballot Scanner Operating Team Members
Team #1	Robert Moody & Michael Myers
Team #2	Bety Scott & Andrew Pak
Team #3	Lukas Faber

Canvassing of Ballots

Ms. Coley made a motion to accept and approve the opening and tabulation of the ballots. Mr. Watson seconded the motion, and the motion passed unanimously.

Challenges During Canvass

No challenges were made during the canvass.

Canvass Closing

Printing Canvass Results

After scanning all accepted ballots, Ms. Jones and Mr. DeLima locked the ballot scanners and printed an Election Results Report. Ms. Perrone confirmed that the number of accepted ballots equaled the number of ballots counted by the ballot scanners. The Board of Canvassers signed one copy of the Voting Results Report and attached it to the Zero Report. The other copy was posted on the inside of the front doors to the Robert Moton Building next to the Zero Reports for public viewing.

A copy of the *DS200 Integrity Report – MIB2 Canvass* is attached to the minutes.

DAILY CANVASSING STATISTICS

Mail-in Ballot 2 Canvass Statistics	Number of Ballots
Mail-in Ballots Presented in Mail-in Ballot 2 Canvass	300
Provisional Ballots Presented in Mail-in Ballot Canvass 2	51
Total Ballots Presented in Mail-in Ballot Canvass 2	351
Mail-in Ballots Accepted	263
Provisional Ballots Accepted	51
Total Ballots Accepted	314
Rejected Mail-in Ballots	37

RELEASE OF UNOFFICIAL RESULTS

Mr. Foster announced the results from the entire mail-in ballot canvass.

Mail-In Ballot Canvass Statistics	Number of Ballots
A) Total Ballots Presented	23,449
B) Total Mail-in Ballots Presented	21,064
C) Total Provisional Ballots Presented	2,385

Carroll County Board of Canvassers
300 S Center Street, Rm 212
Westminster, MD 21157

Friday, November 15, 2024 - Mail-In Ballot 2 Canvass

D) Total Ballots Accepted	23,350
E) Accepted in Full Provisional Ballots	2,054
F) Accepted in Part Provisional Ballots	284
G) Accepted Mail-in Ballots	21,012
H) Total Rejected Ballots	83
I) Rejected Provisional Ballots	39
J) Rejected Mail-in Ballots	44

VERIFICATION OF VOTE COUNT

Ms. Perrone presented the Board of Canvassers with the verification results, and the Board of Canvassers reviewed the results. Ms. Coley made a motion to accept the verification results. Ms. Donaldson seconded the motion, and the motion passed unanimously.

POST ELECTION AUDITS

Ms. Perrone explained that staff conducted several post-election verifications and audits. Staff manually added the Voting Results Reports from each ballot scanner in the precincts previously randomly selected by the local board of elections and compared the manually added totals with the totals produced by the election database for those precincts. Ms. Perrone confirmed that all the numbers matched in precincts 05-002, 05-003, and 06-004. In addition, any variances in the number of voters checked in on the pollbooks versus the number of ballots scanned on a scanner at all three early voting centers and 25 polling places were within the State Board of Elections accepted guidelines of + or - 5. The State Board of Elections required an additional audit at 07-007/07-010 because the number of voters checked in on the pollbook and the number of ballots scanned on the scanners was + or - 5. After the audit was complete, it was determined that the wrong ballot styles was given to voters at Westminster Elementary School. No votes would have been affected because the content of the ballots was the same.

Ms. Perrone explained that a similar verification was performed on each ballot scanner used during the Pre-Election Day canvass and Mail-in Ballot 1 Canvass. Staff manually added the Voting Results Reports printed from each ballot scanner used during those canvasses and manually added totals to a report printed from the election database for the canvass. Ms. Perrone confirmed that all the numbers matched.

Ms. Perrone explained that a sample of accepted provisional ballots were reviewed to determine whether the provisional voter was registered to vote at the time of the election, voted the ballot for the precinct in which the voter resides, and all other applicable criteria were met. A sample of partially accepted provisional ballots was also reviewed to confirm that a voter was registered to vote at the time of the election, did not vote the ballot for the precinct in which the voter resides, and all other applicable criteria were met. Staff also reviewed a sample of rejected provisional ballots to confirm that the voter was not

Carroll County Board of Canvassers
300 S Center Street, Rm 212
Westminster, MD 21157

Friday, November 15, 2024 - Mail-In Ballot 2 Canvass

registered to vote at the time of the election or the voter's ballot was rejected for another valid reason. Ms. Perrone confirmed that all the numbers matched.

Ms. Perrone explained that all ballot images from early voting, election day, and all mail-in ballots canvassed and tabulated prior to election day were sent to a third-party for re-tabulation. The vendor produces reports comparing precinct-level results from the voting system against the precinct-level results from the re-tabulation, and these reports show any differences between the two sets of results. Ms. Perrone showed the reports and confirmed that any differences between the two sets of results were less than 0.5%, the threshold for additional auditing.

CERTIFICATION OF ELECTION RESULTS

Ms. Perrone explained that the post-election verifications and audits had no discrepancies, or the discrepancies were less than the vote margin of any contest on the ballot in that precinct and presented the Board of Canvassers with the election results. The Board of Canvassers reviewed the election results and signed a cover sheet explaining the various audits.

NEXT BOARD OF CANVASSERS' MEETING

If additional ballots are received, the Board of Canvassers will convene after the next meeting of the Carroll County Board of Elections. The next meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, December 18, 2024, at 10 am at the Robert Moton Room at the Robert Moton Building, 300 S Center Street, Westminster.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 11:43 am on a motion by Ms. Coley. The motion was seconded by Ms. Donaldson and the motion passed unanimously.